

Document Name	
Author	Paul Jennings
Date	29 November 2019
Reference	



Agenda

Meeting	Oban Bay Navigation Risk Assessment Review 2019
Meeting Purpose	Improving Marine Safety in Oban Bay
Venue	NLB offices Oban
Date	14:00-16:00 29 October 2019

Attendees:

Name	Organisation
Phil Day	NLB Chair
Eric Chapman	Oban Bay Community Berthing & Oban Sailing Club
Billy Forteith	Oban RNLI
Paul Jennings	OBHM
David McHardie	CMAL
Findlay Mackay	NLB
Robert Kinkaid	Oban Stakeholders
Simon Alletson	MCA
Mark Thompson	CalMac Ferries Ltd

Item	Detail	Responsible	Action	Timescale
1	Apologies Argyll & Bute Council OCHDA	All		
2	Previous meeting notes On Oban Harbour Website	All		
3	What has changed within Oban Bay from 2018 to 2019?	All		
	<p>Port (geography) – No Change</p> <p>Shipping (types of) – Leisure (yachts) numbers up, Small cargo vessels and fish farm vessels numbers up. These are perceptions no hard figures are available.</p> <p>Vessel movements - More yachts visiting the North Pier Pontoons, a reported increase of about 50%. This results in more small vessels crossing the large vessel channel</p> <p>AtoNs (north entrance buoyage) – VHF 12 signage on Kerrera Breakwater and North Spit light to remind vessel to monitor VHF Ch 12 whilst in Oban Bay. New north entrance lateral marks replacing cardinal mark system. New sector light at Dunollie with same characteristics (brighter and sharper)</p> <p>Charts (anchorages) – North entrance recommended small vessel routes Admiralty on electronic charts, which also have trial 1m contour safety limitation warning system. No. 1 and No. 3</p>			

Item	Detail	Responsible	Action	Timescale
	<p>anchorages moved off large vessel approach routes.</p> <p>Surveys (new) – new Oct 2018 survey of north entrance conducted by Antares, information fed into UKHO. Shallow patches around Cow Point identified in Admiralty publications have been shown to not exist, with this latest survey demonstrating all depths in these locations are in fact below 5m.</p> <p>Education (leaflet & distribution) – leaflet for the leisure user improved and distribution widened</p> <p>Other – VHF announcements made by large vessels is now more succinct and made at the point of departure. This has assisted both leisure users and operators.</p>			
4	Review of reported incidents & other risks identified	All		
	<p>Reported grounding incidents at the Corran Ledge have reduced from 15 (2018) to 1 (2019). This is attributed to the success of the new buoyage at this location.</p> <p>Navigational Infringements have also reduced (despite the perception yacht numbers have increased) but are still very significant in number. This is attributed to all the measures implemented for 2019 having a combined success (AtoNs, Chart changes and Education).</p>			

Item	Detail	Responsible	Action	Timescale
	<p>Diving incidents were static at 3 but the potential outcome of a vessel colliding with a diver being very serious. All had been reported to the MCA, HSE Diving and Marine Scotland. All agencies had put in remedial actions.</p> <p>It was noted there was a heightened interaction of commercial traffic between North pier pontoons and NLB pier. These vessel movements are currently not co-ordinated due to the lack of a harbour authority.</p>			
5	Hierarchy of risk review	JM		
	<p>Hierarchy correct with the exception of the Diving Risk, where there have been three quite serious incidents/ near misses reported. Diving to be reviewed to be 2 for likelihood and 4 for severity. Mitigation measures have already been put in place by MCA, Marine Scotland and HSE Diving for these reported incidents. No further incidents have been reported since these measures were implemented.</p> <p>Concern was raised that cruise vessel tenders are still featuring regularly in incidents reported. Further details are to be given to the MCA for awareness action. It is also suggested that trade bodies and Cruise Scotland are contacted directly to raise awareness with cruise vessel operators.</p> <p>PWC are to be added as an additional risk / hazard to be able to properly monitor and identify control measures as they are dissimilar to all other vessel categories.</p>		<p>PJ to adjust diving risk</p> <p>PJ to Pass details to MCA.</p> <p>Suggested A&BC HM contact trade bodies and Cruise Scotland to raise awareness</p> <p>PJ to add</p>	<p>Dec 19</p> <p>Nov 19</p> <p>Dec 19</p> <p>Dec 19</p>

Item	Detail	Responsible	Action	Timescale
	<p>MOB from vessel to be added as a risk / hazard category</p> <p>Add risk of AtoN failure to NRA</p> <p>Identified that small commercial / cruise vessel operating from North Pier Breakwater operate in a 'free for all' manner with respect for berthing. Suggested berths are identified by a numbering system so greater clarity of allocation and destination / approach can be achieved.</p>		<p>PJ to add</p> <p>PJ to Add</p> <p>A&BC HM to consider suggestion and promulgate berth numbering system for North Pier Pontoon Breakwater berths if appropriate</p>	<p>Dec 10</p> <p>Dec 19</p> <p>Dec 19</p>
6	<p>What more can be done to reduce the identified risks? Which risks require additional or different control measures?</p>	All		
	<p>Continue to engage with leisure users (yachts) to educate about Large Vessel Channel. Continue to improve leisure guide.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enhance Incident Reporting section visibility • Adjust chart to reflect latest survey • Add additional 10 Knots speed limit sign by Maiden Island approach <p>Widen leisure guide distribution to also include: Coll Hotel Colonsay Port Terminal Port Ellen Marina Tobermory Marina Lochaline Harbour and Pontoon Facilities</p> <p>Ports of Scotland publication to include Oban Bay</p>		<p>All to submit further suggestions where leisure guide can be improved.</p>	<p>Dec 19</p>

Item	Detail	Responsible	Action	Timescale
	<p>safety advert</p> <p>Engage with cruise vessel industry in wider and different manners to improve tender coxswain standards, which are currently unregulated.</p> <p>Attempt to engage with PWC users to educate about risks.</p> <p>Attempt to engage with divers to educate about risks.</p> <p>Implement measures to clarify / simplify commercial vessel movements to and from berths</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number Pontoon breakwater berths <p>Provide greater guidance for commercial & leisure vessel approaching / departing North Pier pontoons</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide clear diagram of North Pier pontoons so vessels can approach and depart the entrance using the recommended routes to avoid grounding and large vessel traffic. 			
7	AOB			
	<p>Oban Bay Community Berthing (OBCB) are in the process of upgrading their landing pontoon and applying to expand the number of visitor moorings, with an additional line of moorings to the seaward side (west) of their current outer moorings. This will reduce the free water between the moorings and the Sgeir Rathaid Reef.</p>			

Item	Detail	Responsible	Action	Timescale
	It was reported that there is pressure to introduce additional mooring outside of the proposed OBCB expanded moorings area. This would create a complete mooring zone, effectively closing the east side of the Sgeir Rathaid Reef to through traffic, if implemented.			
9	Next Meeting date?	All	Nov 2020 TBC	